

# Audit Committee Meeting May 17, 2016



Presented for Review and Approval
August 16, 2016

### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

l.	Review and Approval of the Minutes to the February 23, 2016 ERS Audit Committee Meeting2	2
II.	Presentation, Discussion and Consideration of Internal Audit Reports	2
III.	Adjournment of the ERS Board of Trustees Audit Committee and Recess of the Board of Trustees	3

## AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF TEXAS

May 17, 2016 ERS Board Room ERS Building – 200 E. 18<sup>th</sup> Street Austin, Texas 78701

#### TRUSTEES PRESENT

I. Craig Hester, Chair Doug Danzeiser, Vice-Chair Ilesa Daniels, Member Brian Ragland, Member

#### TRUSTEES NOT PRESENT

Cydney Donnell, Member (Excused by the Board) Frederick E. Rowe, Jr., Member

#### **ERS STAFF PRESENT**

Porter Wilson, Executive Director Catherine Terrell, Deputy Executive Director Paula A. Jones, Deputy Executive Director & General Counsel Shack Nail, Special Projects and Policy Advisor Tony Chavez, Internal Auditor Robert Kukla, Director of Benefit Contracts Machelle Pharr, Chief Financial Officer Gabrielle Stokes, Director of Procurement & Contract Oversight Tom Tull, Chief Investment Officer Kelley Davenport, Executive Office Beth Gilbert, Internal Audit Robert Lee, Investments Betty Martin, Investments Karen Norman, Internal Audit Jonathan Puckett, Internal Audit Robert Sessa, Investments Keith Yawn, Enterprise Planning Office

#### **ALSO PRESENT**

Keith Barnes, Blue Cross Blue Shield of Texas David Dorman, Active Health Management Joseph Halbert, Senator Schwertner's Office Yves-Laurent Khary, Blue Cross Blue Shield of Texas Bobby Wilkinson, Office of the Governor Mr. Craig Hester, Chairman of the Board of Trustees of the Employees Retirement System of Texas (ERS), noting a quorum was present, called the meeting to order and read the following statement:

"A public notice of the Board of Trustees meeting containing all items on the proposed agenda was filed with the Office of the Secretary of State at 9:03 a.m. on Thursday, May 5, 2016 as required by Chapter 551, Texas Government Code, referred to as "The Open Meetings Law."

The Board of Trustees then convened as a committee of the whole at 8:15 to consider Audit Committee agenda items.

## I. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES TO THE FEBRUARY 23, 2016 ERS AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING

Mr. Craig Hester, opened the floor for a motion on the approval of the minutes from the Audit Committee Meeting held February 23, 2016.

**MOTION** made by Mr. Brian Ragland, seconded by Mr. Doug Danzeiser and carried unanimously by the present members of the Audit Committee approved the minutes to the meeting held on February 23, 2016

#### II. PRESENTATION, DISCUSSION AND CONSIDERATION OF INTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS

Mr. Tony Chavez, Director of Internal Audit (IA), introduced Ms. Karen Norman, internal auditor. Mr. Chavez reported on the Group Benefits Program (GBP) procurements follow-up audit. Based on related internal and State Auditor audit recommendations, the objective was to assess the status of corrective actions and implementation of recommendations in the contract procurement and management process following the Texas contract management guide. Exhibits presented an overview of contract management framework made up of contract planning, procurement and monitoring/oversight areas. Mr. Chavez referenced the numerous GBP related contracts procured and monitored by the Benefits Contracts Division.

Ms. Norman reviewed inherent operational risk factors in the procurement process when evaluating and communicating best value, performance factors and lowest cost measurements. She emphasized the GBP program's complexity containing multiple deliverables and price points. As a result of Senate Bill 20, regulatory changes in contract management best practices have been instituted to comply with the new Contract Management Guide. While compliance, planning and development scope areas were rated "satisfactory", the overall rating for the procurement, selection and recommendation process was "needs improvement". Management is in compliance with the State Auditor's Office contract management requirements. However, the procurement evaluation process methodology needs to improve RFP evaluation scoring tools incorporating elements recommended in the Texas Contract Management Guide.

Mr. Hester asked about the timing of this audit and the creation of the new Office of Procurement and Contract Oversight (OPCO). IA worked with the both Benefit Contracts and OPCO during this audit. Board members asked questions concerning the evaluation matrix and best value. Mr. Chavez stated the audit was concerned with methodology. The board asked about the complexity and necessary elements of the scoring sheet. Ms. Norman stated no elements were missing from the scoring sheets. The board asked additional questions about the complexity of the scoring matrix and performance factors. Ms. Gabrielle Stokes, Director of OPCO, further clarified the scoring process methodology evolution during the audit and its future use for contract evaluation.

Mr. Chavez then introduced Mr. Jonathan Puckett, internal auditor, to review the quarterly procedures to test compliance with ERS' Investment Policy using agreed upon procedures (AUP) as a part of the FY16 Annual Audit Plan. Reporting impacts and risk to the organization concerning investment compliance – securities lending, Mr. Puckett reported that in February the Investments Division temporarily suspended its securities lending program. Recalling these borrowed securities contributed to atypical instances of noncompliance in diversification limit for Eurozone counterparties exceeding 10% and diversification limit for non-Eurozone counterparties exceeded 20%. Mr. Chavez stated that Investments kept Internal Audit informed so IA was aware when the compliance flags were raised.

Two other minor compliance issues were noted. They were both a result of corporate timing issues and were resolved within a few days. Mr. Hester noted on the personal trading side, there were no policy violations and congratulated the Investments staff.

There being no further discussion, the Audit Committee adjourned.

## III. ADJOURNMENT OF THE ERS BOARD OF TRUSTEES AUDIT COMMITTEE AND RECESS OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Following a temporary recess, the Board of Trustees will reconvene with the Investment Advisory Committee to take up the following Joint Board of Trustees and Investment Advisory Committee agenda items.